Annex 2.3.3

Process of the survey on identifying the scientific production of Milena Penkowa

In the period 12 July – 1 August 2011, the Secretariat to the Investigation Panel conducted a survey among the co-authors of Milena Penkowa (MP), including MP. The survey aimed at identifying Milena Penkowa’s scientific work in the published papers co-authored by her. Each author received a questionnaire for each paper he/she has co-authored with MP.

The questionnaires asked for information on MP’s, respectively the co-authors’, scientific contributions to the papers. The result of the survey, together with the appr. 100 papers (full text), formed part of the basis for the Panel’s investigation.

In total there are 219 co-authors of MP, with a total number of co-authorships of 631, including MP’s. However it has not been possible to identify contact data to more than the 165 of the 219 co-authors. Please note in this connection that the publication period of the papers in the Panel’s investigation starts already in 1995.

The Secretariat has distributed a total of 530 questionnaires to 165 co-authors incl. MP. The majority of the questionnaires were distributed 1 August 2011 – via the on-line survey system Inquisite. In total 256 on-line questionnaires were distributed via e-mail to 154 co-authors. The first deadline for answering the questionnaires in the Inquisite on-line system was 15 August. A reminder was distributed 16 August to those co-authors who had not yet answered, with a deadline of 22 August. A second reminder was distributed 23 August with a deadline of 31 August.

The questionnaires to MP were also sent 1 August, but as an assembled word-file, as a facilitating alternative to otherwise responding one at a time on-line to the 96 questionnaires sent to her.

Furthermore, 174 questionnaires in word-format were sent to 10 co-authors already mid July – partly due to most of these co-authors’ large numbers of co-authorships with MP (thus facilitating the co-authors’ responding), partly because some of the co-authors would be on vacation in August.

Finally the Secretariat e-mailed a questionnaire 25 October to each of MP’s 4 co-authors of a paper, of which the Secretariat had not been aware initially, as MP’s name is spelled with a “v”, incorrectly, in this paper. The Secretariat was informed about this paper by MP in connection with her questionnaire response. MP had furthermore added a questionnaire response for this paper. The 4 co-authors all mailed responses to this questionnaire. (The 4 co-authors had already responded some questionnaires in August, concerning their other co-authorships with MP, distributed by the Secretariat 1 August via Inquisite).

---

1 Actually MP responded 98 questionnaires, as she added two papers: the one for which the Secretariat sent questionnaires subsequently to all co-authors and another paper of which MP is sole author.
More specifics on the survey are presented in the following sections.

Annex 3.1.1 to the investigation report provides statistics on the results of the survey, while annex 3.1.2.1 is the excel file with all the questionnaire responses and annex 3.1.2.2 consists of 4 files with all enclosures to the responses submitted by co-authors.

### Specifics on the papers and co-authors of MP

**Abbreviations:**
- MP = Milena Penkowa
- KU = University of Copenhagen
- DCSD = the Danish Committees on Scientific Dishonesty

#### A. The papers

**Total number of papers (co-)authored by MP before July 2011: 106**

Including papers reported to the Danish police (1 paper) or DCSD (5 papers) before July 2011. The 6 papers reported to Police or DCSD are not included in the Panel’s investigation. However questionnaires were sent for 4 of those papers to a few co-authors (see further below on this page). In addition, the Panel has read those papers in order to obtain knowledge about the whole co-authorship of MP. In addition to the mentioned 106 papers, there are 2 announcements of retraction of 2 papers co-authored by MP. (Questionnaires were not distributed for these 2 announcements).

**In total 14 papers reported to Police or DCSD, 2 of these have been retracted**

6 papers have been reported to Police or DCSD before July 2011, and 12 papers have been reported to DCSD in July-August 2011 (of which 4 had been reported already):

- Paper reported to Police: A102.
- Papers reported to DCSD before July 2011: A36, A37, A54, A68 and A71.
- Papers retracted: A36 and A37. (Announcements of these retractions: A306 and A307).
- In July 2011, 12 papers were reported to KU (by prof. Henrik Galbo) and subsequently reported to DCSD by prof. Bente Klarlund Pedersen. These are: A8, A16, A33, A36, A37, A38, A40, A54, A68, A130, A211 and A212. Please note that 4 of these 12 papers were already reported to DCSD previously (A36, A37, A54 and A68), and 2 of those were retracted (A36 and A37). The other 8 papers, i.e. A8, A16, A33, A38, A40, A130, A211 and A212, are included in the Panel’s investigation.

**We have sent a few questionnaires for 4 of the 6 papers reported before July 2011 to Police and DCSD**

For the 4 reported papers A36, A68, A71 and A102, questionnaires were mailed to Juan Hidalgo (JH) and, for each of those 4 papers, one of his co-authors. The main reason for this was that JH already earlier had sent a declaration on his co-authorships to KU, which included these four papers, and it was clear from this declaration that some of the papers were related to some of the
papers that are included in the Panel’s investigation. Thus, in order to provide the best possible overview for the Panel, and in order to ensure continuation in relation to JH’s previous correspondence, the Secretariat also included these papers in the questionnaire to JH and to some of his co-authors. For the two other of the 6 reported papers (A37 and A54) no questionnaires were distributed.

Number of papers for which questionnaires have been distributed: 103

No questionnaires were distributed for:
- the 2 announcements of retraction of 2 papers
- 2 of the papers reported to DCSD (A37, A54)
- MP’s PhD thesis (A305). We found it sufficient to distribute questionnaires for the 4 papers on which the thesis is based.

Please note that at the time of the survey the Panel had not yet decided to exclude publications which are book chapters, reviews, abstracts etc. Therefore questionnaires were distributed for most of these papers.

Please also note that 4 (reported) papers were sent exclusively to Juan Hidalgo and a co-author. In addition, an abstract (A87) was sent to one co-author (PB Hansen) solely, as it turned out that this abstract was abstract to another paper (A90).

Number of (these 103) papers of which there are one or more co-authors besides MP: 99

MP is sole author of the 4 of the 103 papers. In one further case (paper A131) we have sent a questionnaire to MP solely, because we had not been able identify contact data for her two co-authors of A131. As this paper is a review, no further or later attempts were made to identify contact data for these two co-authors.

B. The co-authors

Total number of co-authors: 219 (incl. MP)

Number of co-authors for whom contact data have been identified: 165 (incl. MP)

The number 165 is the number of co-authors, for whom we have found e-mail addresses, to whom we have submitted questionnaire(s), and from whom we have not received any information about “wrong addressee”. Thus, we originally sent questionnaires to some further co-authors for whom we had found email addresses, but from whom we received information about wrong address or addressee.

Among the (165) identified co-authors there may still be some whose contact data are actually wrongly identified, i.e. among those from whom we have not received questionnaire responses.

---

2 This includes the one paper which MP informed about, and for which questionnaires subsequently were sent to all co-authors. In addition it includes another paper, which MP also added in her questionnaire response and of which MP is sole author.
C. The co-authorships

Total number of co-authorships: 631
There is one co-authorship per paper per author.

Number of co-authorships, for which a questionnaire has been distributed: 530
The number 530 is the number of co-authorships for the 165 identified co-authors.